

**Report:**

**Educators' Conditions  
of  
Service  
Task Force**

**submitted to the Honourable Alden  
McLaughlin, JP**  
Minister for Education Training, Employment,  
Youth, Sports and Culture

**by**

**Mr. Conor O'Dea (Chairman)**

**Report: Educators' Conditions of Service Task Force**

**Report: Educators' Conditions of Service Task Force**

Section A.

1. Executive Summary
2. Background and Terms of Reference

Section B.

1. Remuneration
2. Benefits
3. Professional Development
4. Performance Management
5. Other Matters

Appendix 1            Terms of Reference

Appendix 2            Survey Results

Appendix 3            Cayman Islands Government Salary Scale, January 2007

Appendix 4            Working Conditions

# **Report: Educators' Conditions of Service Task Force**

## **Section A**

### **1. Executive Summary**

In an effort to address one of the key action points arising from the National Education Conference in September 2005, the Honorable Alden McLaughlin, Minister of Education, formed a Task Force to undertake a review of compensation levels, employment terms, and conditions of educators within the Cayman Islands Government ("CIG") education system.

The Task Force, appointed by the Ministry of Education, consisted of twelve individuals and met twice a month from October 2006 to December 2006.

The Task Force first reviewed the current state of the CIG remuneration practices, policies and procedures along with any proposed changes. The team then conducted an examination and comparison of remuneration practices for educators in selected countries across the world. In addition, a survey was conducted of all public service educators which received an over two-thirds response rate.

The results of the review concluded that there is a need for a number of changes in the compensation levels and employment terms and conditions within the CIG education system. Our examination of other international systems indicates that there is considerable variation in the approaches taken to address this issue elsewhere. The survey provided some valuable direct feedback from Cayman Islands' educators and highlighted the urgent need for increased communication between Government and educators in the area of benefits and entitlements. The research provided some justification for higher salaries for educators, however, evidence of a relationship between the pay and quality of educators and outcomes for students is inconclusive worldwide. Overall, we found locally that educators are most concerned about feeling valued, having opportunities to develop, and trusting their employer, in this case, the Cayman Islands Government.

The Task Force has several key findings and recommendations which are summarized in the tables below. The recommendations do not come with any implementation plan or costings and many of them will require further investigation before finalizing implementation.

## Report: Educators' Conditions of Service Task Force

### 1. Remuneration

#	Key Findings	Recommendations
1.1	A moratorium was placed on salary increments in 2001. Educators' salaries have become uncompetitive, as evidenced by difficulties with the retention of good educators and recruitment of quality educators.	Automatic annual salary increments should not be reintroduced. Instead all increases in salary should be linked to performance whilst ensuring they remain competitive. See section 4.1.
1.2	In general, CIG uses a Cost of Living Adjustment ("COLA") to maintain salaries in line with inflation. COLA is a flat across the board increase, unrelated to performance.	Salaries should be reviewed annually based on individual educator's appraisals and as part of the performance management system. (see 4.1) Salary scales should be increased annually in line with inflation.
1.3	Educators are not sufficiently aware of their remuneration and entitlements.	Pay and entitlements should be clearly communicated to all educators on a regular basis with immediate introduction of an annual benefits statement
1.4	Our survey showed that educators do not strongly support a performance related remuneration system. They would however support a system that is partially based on performance.	CIG should review the introduction of a performance related remuneration system as the Committee believes it to be the most productive way of improving the quality of teaching and education.
1.5	Comprehensive and up to date job descriptions do not exist in many cases. Some educators' roles have also not been evaluated in many years.	A priority is to have job descriptions reviewed and rewritten. Following this a full job evaluation exercise should be undertaken to ensure that educators are appropriately graded for pay scale purposes.

### 2. Benefits

#	Key Findings	Recommendations
2.1	Educators have personal responsibilities which necessitate personal time not allowed for under the present system.	A personal day policy be developed as part of educators benefits package. Additionally, a solution should be sought whereby educators may schedule personal hours in exceptional circumstances.

## Report: Educators' Conditions of Service Task Force

### 3. Professional Development

#	Key Findings	Recommendations
3.1	The CIG already provides some support for ongoing professional education, however, the offerings are inadequate, and educators are not aware of the various programs and are not encouraged to participate.	A professional development culture needs to be instilled in education. Administrators and educators must embrace this culture to ensure that standards of classroom teaching are enhanced over time. A comprehensive system which is fully understood by all administrators and educators is necessary.

### 4. Performance Management

#	Key Findings	Recommendations
4.1	The current performance management system and culture is inadequate and ineffective.	The Committee recommends the introduction of a comprehensive performance management system to ensure improvement in the quality of teaching and subsequently, the quality of education. The performance management system would consist of regular appraisals, mentoring, oversight of disciplinary matters, professional development, and other needs. It would also tie into salary reviews and a bonus scheme, if introduced.

### 5. Other

#	Key Findings	Recommendations
5.1	There is a significant challenge in recruiting and retaining young Caymanian educators due to uncompetitive salary and working conditions.	The creation of a fast tracking system for high potential educators with less than 5 years experience in education should be considered.
5.2	Educators are dissatisfied with poor surroundings and inappropriate responsibilities.	The condition of facilities and classroom practices need to be addressed. Job descriptions should assign appropriate responsibilities to facilities management to allow educators to focus on their key accountabilities - teaching and learning.

## **Report: Educators' Conditions of Service Task Force**

### **2. Background and Terms of Reference**

Arising from concerns aired at the National Education Conference in September 2005, the Honorable Alden McLaughlin, Minister of Education, formed this Task Force to undertake a review of educators' salaries and conditions.

The Task Force was charged with the Terms of Reference by the Ministry of Education in 2006. The Terms of Reference can be viewed in Appendix 1. The committee set about fulfilling this responsibility in the following ways:

1. Decided on primary areas of focus
2. Researched the existing system
3. Researched alternative models
4. Held regular Committee meetings
5. Invited experts from related organizations to present at committee meetings
6. Conducted a comprehensive survey of all educators in the CIG system

The Task Force was chaired by Conor O'Dea (private sector) and committee members included primary school representatives Valerie Bell Williams, Elvie Clarke, Kiva Powell, secondary school representatives Ian Godet, Pedro Lazzari, Lydia Warren, and private sector representatives Taron Jackman, Lois Kellyman and Don Seymour. Peter Beckford and Katrina Jurn also served the Task Force as representatives from the Ministry of Education.

The initial meeting of the Task Force took place on October 5<sup>th</sup>, 2006 and subsequent meetings were normally held on a bi-weekly basis to mid December 2006.

The Committee reviewed:

- Terms and conditions of employment of educators in CIG schools
- Comparative data on terms and conditions of educators in private schools in the Cayman Islands
- Comparative data on terms and conditions of educators in New Zealand, England and Bermuda
- Performance management and performance related remuneration models

The committee received presentations on:

- The new governance model for education services in the Cayman Islands
- The Hay System of grading and job evaluation

The committee designed a survey which was sent to all educators in CIG schools and received a response rate of over two-thirds.

The committee determined that its work should result in a framework of recommendations for implementation and, in some cases, further investigation and consideration.

# Report: Educators' Conditions of Service Task Force

## Section B

### 1. Remuneration

The quality of education systems is intricately linked to the educators within a given system. Remuneration, conditions of employment and the status of educators within a system have tremendous influence on recruitment and morale which, in turn, impact the quality of teaching. It is therefore imperative that both pay and the overall conditions and status of educators are given equal consideration.

#### Areas reviewed

- Current Salary Levels
- Salary Grading
- Movement Along Salary Scales
- Hay System
- Broad Banding Salary Scales
- Comparative Data from Private School Educators' Salaries in the Cayman Islands
- Comparative Data from New Zealand, England and Bermuda

#### Findings

- A.
- 1.1 A moratorium was placed on increments in 2001. Given that, in the absence of any increment, CIG only increases salary levels in line with inflation, there is little motivation for educators to perform at a consistent and higher level.
- Salaries are up to date with regard to COLA from 1999 to present
  - Salaries are 3% behind inflation from 1997 to present
  - Salaries are 15% behind on increments, if they had been maintained, for those in the system before 2002

***Committee Recommendation: Automatic annual salary increments should not be reintroduced. Instead all increases in salary should be linked to performance and inflation.***

1.2

Since 1997, educators' salaries have not kept up with the rate of inflation and have gradually become uncompetitive primarily as a consequence of the moratorium placed on annual increments. Even after the recent COLA grant of 7% in December 2006 and 1% in January 2007, educators were still behind 3 % when considering the CPI in the Cayman Islands since 1997.

Based on satisfactory performance, the grading bands used by CIG, shown in Appendix 2, were designed for CIG employees to move one point along a grade

## Report: Educators' Conditions of Service Task Force

band on an annual basis. This amounted to a 2.5% annual increment over and above the annual COLA. These increments have not been awarded to any CIG employee since 2001, which is the primary reason for educators' salaries not remaining competitive.

If we take into consideration:

- a) the lack of annual increment since 2001;
- b) the position that educators in the system since 2001 would be in if the historical practice of increments had been continued; and
- c) actual inflation *vis a vis* COLAs since 1997;

educators' salaries are 18 % behind. We are advised by CIG that with the payment of the 7% COLA in December 2006 and the 1% COLA in January 2007 will bring all civil servants up to 2006. We are advised that as of January 1<sup>st</sup> 2007, with the introduction of the new Personnel Regulations (2006), traditional increments no longer exist. Further, a performance based system has been proposed for the Civil Service.

Our survey results (found in full in Appendix 3) indicate that over 75% of educators feel that their remuneration compares poorly with similarly qualified staff in the business sector and that salaries should be increased.

It should be noted that while salaries may be lagging, CIG contributes to all CIG employee pension plans at a rate of 12% of salary, unlike the private sector where typically 5% of salary is deducted by way of an employee contribution toward pension. Pensions and other benefits must be considered in assessing overall competitiveness of remuneration. [See Section B.2.]

***Committee Recommendation: Salaries should be reviewed annually based on individual's appraisals and as part of a performance management system (see Section B.4. Performance Management). Salary scales should be increased annually in line with inflation.***

### B. 1.3

Educators are not sufficiently aware of salary, benefits and other entitlements, which indicates that there has not been proper communication between the relevant HR departments and educators. 81% of educators said they were vaguely aware or unaware of the full scope of their benefits.

All staff employed by the Ministry of Education should be provided with, on a regular basis with immediate introduction, an annual benefits statement outlining the compensation and benefits and the monetary value for benefits paid during the course of the year. Additionally, the development of an educators' intranet for

## Report: Educators' Conditions of Service Task Force

communication on remuneration and benefits would be an asset. Such a tool could also be used for better general communication within the educational community. There should be full electronic communication to all educators within the system. The committee is advised that at this time, there is not.

***Committee Recommendation: Pay and entitlements should be clearly communicated to all educators on a regular basis with immediate introduction of an annual benefits statement.***

C.

According to a 1996 report from the OECD in a chapter titled *Teachers' Pay and Conditions*, 'The salary of an experienced primary school educator varies from one to two times average GDP per capita in OECD countries'<sup>1</sup>.

This GDP comparison was applied by the Committee to the Cayman Islands context as an indicator of the relative position of educators' salaries in the Cayman Islands compared to OECD countries. Taking the midpoint in salary grade L (Classroom Teachers), \$50,616, as the salary of an experienced primary school educator and comparing this with the Cayman Island's GDP per capita of CI\$39,800 (2005), we see that educators' salaries in the Cayman Islands are 1.27 times GDP per capita, falling in the lower range for OECD countries. The Cayman Islands falls in the same range as New Zealand, Austria and Italy and falls behind the highest ranked countries such as Portugal, Spain, Ireland and the UK.

Data from New Zealand, England, and Bermuda government schools and Cayman Islands private schools indicate that most educators feel underpaid and salaries are perceived to be low relative to business sector jobs requiring a similar level of qualification.

D.

1.4

Purely rewarding length of service, under the increment system, is seen to be unfair and ineffective. Educators' starting salary is determined by number of years experience<sup>2</sup> and up until 2001, annual increments, while technically dependent on satisfactory performance, were effectively automatic and rewarded years in the system. Educators are not properly rewarded for performance or acquiring additional qualifications. Although 61% of educators do not support a pure performance related pay system, the committee's survey found that 80% of educators support a system for remuneration that considers both length of service and performance.

---

<sup>1</sup> Education at a Glance: Analysis. The Centre for Educational Research and Innovation, OECD, 1996.

<sup>2</sup> Number of years experience as it relates to the specific post.

## Report: Educators' Conditions of Service Task Force

Research<sup>3</sup> shows that:

- Raising pay across the board is ineffective and inefficient.
- Incentive structured salary adjustments have better results for raising student achievement.
- Incentives in the form of professional development yield greater returns than only increases in salary.

***Committee Recommendations: CIG should review the introduction of a performance related remuneration system as the Committee believes it to be the most productive way of improving the quality of teaching and education.***

### E. Job Descriptions and Evaluation

1.5

There is a need for a complete review and re-write of educators' job descriptions to accurately reflect their level of responsibility and broad range of functions and skills. The absence of current and accurate job descriptions contributes to the ineffectiveness of any existing performance management and job evaluation. Thorough complete job descriptions will contribute to a more effective appraisal system.

Our survey found that 68% of educators felt that their job descriptions needed adjustment, with 31% feeling that significant updating is needed.

The job evaluation system used for the Civil Service resulting in grades should be reviewed to ensure it accurately measures the role played by educators. The grades currently assigned to educators within the Civil Service grading system may not reflect the responsibility and essential role played by educators.

***Committee Recommendation: Job descriptions should be updated so that educators' jobs can be evaluated to ensure job descriptions accurately reflect their level of responsibility and broad range of functions and skills. A full job evaluation exercise must be undertaken to ensure that educators are appropriately graded for pay scale purposes. The Committee believes this will potentially lead to an upgrade in salary grade for educators within the CIG system. This will also help address the equity and parity within the system, discussed in the Terms of Reference.***

### D. Cayman Brac and Little Cayman

---

<sup>3</sup> Wendy Wyman and Michael Allen, Pay-for-Performance: Key Questions and Lessons from Five Current Models, June 2001.

## **Report: Educators' Conditions of Service Task Force**

The committee has not investigated the details of variations in cost of living and hardship postings between Grand Cayman, Cayman Brac and Little Cayman. Educators from Cayman Brac and Little Cayman recommended to the Committee that further review is necessary. The Committee feels that if further review finds that additional financial compensation is appropriate for those teachers, an allowance is more appropriate than an adjustment to salary.

## Report: Educators' Conditions of Service Task Force

### 2. Benefits

The Committee concluded that the range of benefits offered was adequate overall. A few areas need to be reviewed and improved upon.

#### Areas reviewed

- Pension
- Health Care
- Leave
- Contracted Officers Supplement (COS)
- Sabbaticals – see Section B.2.C.

#### Findings

The survey revealed that, in terms of benefits, professional development opportunities are the highest priority for educators, followed by personal days and sabbaticals. 27% of educators' first choice for the most important benefit was professional development, followed by personal days with 18% and sabbaticals with 15%.

##### A. Pension

A pension contribution is made by CIG at 12%, which compares favorably with the private sector contribution of 10% shared between the employee and employer.

##### B. Health insurance

Health insurance is provided by the CIG through Government facilities and the CINICO system. However, many deem this coverage insufficient due to the restrictions on choice of health care providers. Presently all CINICO coverage is funded by the CIG, that is, no deductions are made from salaries.

***Committee Recommendation: CIG should further investigate enhancing health benefits on a shared cost basis and the feasibility of allowing CIG employees use of private sector health providers.***

##### C. Leave

Vacation is on average 12 weeks per annum, which is very favorable when compared with other professions and in line with education systems world wide. Based on our review, most areas were competitive. The following areas need consideration:

#### Personal Days

## Report: Educators' Conditions of Service Task Force

### 2.1

Due to the nature of the educator's job, vacation days are fixed and cannot be taken during the school term. Educators have personal responsibilities which necessitate personal time (e.g. child's first day of school, funerals, overseas graduations etc. ) and the inflexibility of the system at present, compounded with the unique situation of set vacation times, does not adequately cater for 'personal time'. For example, the Education Department Administration Handbook under section L 4.4 states that visits not pertaining to school matters should be made after normal school hours unless special permission is obtained from the Chief Education Officer. Personal days were ranked second on the survey as benefits teachers considered most important.

***Committee Recommendation: A policy on personal days be developed. These personal days would be part of educators benefit package, and a personal day policy would set guidelines for the taking of these personal days. Additionally, the system be adjusted to cater to personal hours during the school day for exceptional cases, with discretion residing at school level with principals or vice principals rather than with the Education Department.***

#### Maternity Leave

Maternity leave is 30 working days with pay and 60 additional working days without pay. This compares poorly with the private sector which typically grants a minimum of 30 days with full pay, 30 days with ½ pay and 30 days unpaid. Considering the high percentage of young women in the teaching profession, the Committee sees particular importance in reviewing maternity leave provisions.

***Committee Recommendation: Maternity should be made competitive with private sector standards at a minimum.***

#### D. Contracted Officers Supplement (COS)

Contracted Officers Supplement should not be reintroduced.

The system introduced over the last year ensures that teachers coming to the Cayman Islands from overseas (including returning Caymanians) get reasonable travel and settling in allowances. We would expect these to be kept up to date.

#### E. Sabbaticals – see Professional Development

## Report: Educators' Conditions of Service Task Force

### 3. Professional Development

The importance of continuous professional development is recognized worldwide. In our survey, educators in the Cayman Islands ranked professional development as the benefit of highest importance.

#### Areas reviewed

- Availability
- Reward
- Allowances
- Other issues – Non-contact time

#### Findings

##### A. Availability

The CIG provides some support for ongoing professional development; however, the CIG must create and support a much stronger culture of professional development.

Chapter 16 of the Education Department's Administrative Handbook 'Educator Training and Educators' Courses' grants 'Courses are provided by the Department regularly for primary school educators'.

In addition to educators ranking professional development as the benefit of highest priority, 95% of educators felt that current provision for career development and attainment of long term goals is inadequate.

The inadequacy of current professional development opportunities is also evidenced by reports of numerous overseas educators, who, upon leaving the Cayman Islands after a period of employment here, reportedly have had difficulty securing employment immediately because of the lack of professional development while working in the Cayman Islands.

The Committee was made aware that University College of the Cayman Islands (UCCI) will start a Faculty of Education in September 2007. This will offer Cayman educators, for the first time, access to a wide range of highly recognized professional development opportunities locally. The Committee welcomes this on the basis that it will make professional development easily accessible and more affordable.

## Report: Educators' Conditions of Service Task Force

### B. Reward

#### 3.1

Research shows that incentives in the form of professional development yield greater returns than increases in salary alone.<sup>4</sup>

Survey respondents strongly preferred rewards for additional qualification built in to salary versus a one time bonus. 92% of educators feel that remuneration should be increased as additional qualifications are acquired. We understand there is currently no compensation for professional development or qualifications. The Committee felt that rewards being added to salary would be difficult in a full job evaluation system, consequently a one off reward, based on an approved list is recommended (e.g. of up to \$2000). The additional qualifications will enhance the career opportunities of the educator, and it is hoped that where appropriate educators will pursue these opportunities.

***Committee Recommendations: A system for financial reward for additional qualifications and specialist training should be considered.***

### C. Allowances

Currently a number of educators are enrolled in some form of professional development.

Personnel Regulations, formerly General Orders, provision for Part-Time Study Leave allow an employee undertaking a course of part-time study that is related to his employment to be granted "a reasonable amount of paid study leave to attend classes and prepare for and sit examinations" (General Orders, 8.8(1) ).

Chapter 16 of the Education Department Administrative Handbook on Educator Training and Educators Courses states that advanced courses may be considered for teachers after the completion of bonded service and that for courses less than one year full salary will be paid and the expenses for the course will be covered by the CIG. For courses over a year, a salary will not be paid but expenses will be covered by the CIG.

However, reports to the committee by educators indicate that in practice, reasonable paid or unpaid study leave is not granted in many cases. Additionally, while some educators do receive financial assistance and time off for study, many do not and often have to fund courses themselves. Therefore, there exists a need for equity across the system as well as the establishment of clear criteria (or publication of already existing criteria) on this.

---

<sup>4</sup> Wendy Wyman and Michael Allen, Pay-for-Performance: Key Questions and Lessons from Five Current Models, June 2001

## **Report: Educators' Conditions of Service Task Force**

The committee finds that a combination of financial assistance and study leave would be most appropriate for those pursuing additional qualifications relevant to education.

***Committee Recommendations: Financial assistance for further education should be given if the degree matches the needs of the Service. Study leave should be granted for approved programs of study.***

***Committee Recommendations: A sabbatical program should be developed and sabbatical periods be considered under specific circumstances.***

### **D. Non-contact time**

Classroom teachers in CIG schools have their hours divided between contact and non-contact time. Non-contact time is designed to allow for preparation, marking, and mentoring. Survey respondents indicated that the ratio between contact and non-contact time may be inadequate and that this ratio should be reviewed.

Beginner teachers in their first two years are given no special accommodations and are scheduled for the same number of contact and non-contact hours as experienced teachers. Our research showed that other countries provide special accommodation for first and second year teachers.

***Committee Recommendation: Non-contact time for beginner teachers in their first and second years teaching should be increased to allow for mentoring and preparation. Correspondingly, this would also require that some experienced educators are scheduled more non-contact time for mentoring beginning teachers.***

***Committee Recommendation: A professional development culture needs to be instilled in education. The CIG provides support for ongoing professional education, however, the CIG must create and support a much stronger culture. Administrators and educators must embrace this culture to ensure that standards of classroom teaching are enhanced over time.***

## Report: Educators' Conditions of Service Task Force

### 4. Performance Management 4.1

Performance management is recognized worldwide as being essential for improving standards and productivity, both essential for a sound education system.

#### Areas reviewed

- Current Performance Management of Educators in CIG schools
- Performance Management in other education systems
- Performance related pay

#### Findings

- 88% of educators find the existing Performance Management process inadequate.
- Overall, survey respondents did not support performance related pay. However, 80% of educators support a system for remuneration that considers both length of service and performance.

As covered earlier in the report, there is currently a lack of up to date job descriptions which makes any performance management system impossible to administer.

Once job descriptions have been updated, regular appraisals should be carried out, covering performance and setting objectives. Once this system is implemented, operating satisfactorily and trusted by educators, serious consideration can be given to moving towards a performance related remuneration system. We understand that the CIG will be implementing performance related remuneration in 2009.

***Committee Recommendations: The committee recommends the introduction of a comprehensive performance management system to ensure improvement in the quality of teaching and subsequently, the quality of education.***

## Report: Educators' Conditions of Service Task Force

### 5. Other Matters

#### Recruitment and Selection

##### 5.1

Entry-level salaries for educators with a bachelor's degree and a teaching diploma are not competitive when compared with salaries for similar level qualifications in the business sector.

A significant number of young Caymanian educators have left the profession to take up education and teaching roles within the business sector. While remuneration appears to be the main reason given for leaving, working conditions have also contributed.

***Committee Recommendation: The creation of a fast tracking system for high potential educators with less than 5 years experience in education should be considered. This system would allow for greater salary increments in teachers' earlier years in education, ensuring more competitive remuneration with the ultimate intention of greater retention of educators.***

#### Working Conditions

##### 5.2

Working conditions impact educator and pupil morale alike. Where working conditions are satisfactory, a positive and productive working environment results.

Based on feedback from educators on the committee, the condition of facilities and classroom practices needs considerable attention. Educators are dissatisfied with poor surroundings and unreasonable responsibilities. Appendix 4 reflects typical examples of the type of feedback received in relation to working conditions.

We acknowledge that investments will be made in new education facilities and improving existing facilities in the near future. However, there are certain working conditions which are unrelated to short term facilities issues.

Job descriptions should assign responsibilities unrelated to teaching to facilities management and administration, so that educators may focus on delivering quality education to their pupils.

***Committee Recommendation: Working conditions of all government schools should be reviewed with a view to taking remedial action and for consideration when planning for new school campuses.***